PROVIDED BY
FindLaw
WWW.FINDLAW.COM

No. 01-1289

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE COMPANY,

Petitioner,

v.

CURTIS B. CAMPBELL AND INEZ PREECE CAMPBELL,

Respondents.

ON WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UTAH SUPREME COURT

BRIEF OF KEITH N. HYLTON AS *AMICUS CURIAE* IN SUPPORT OF RESPONDENTS

WILLIAM F. MERLIN, JR.
LEE D. GUNN IV
GUNN MERLIN, P.A.
601 Bayshore Blvd.
Suite 800
Tampa, FL 33606
(813) 229-1000

GARRY B. BRYANT
Counsel of Record
LAW OFFICES OF
GARRY B. BRYANT, P.C.
3507 N. Campbell Ave.
Suite 111
Tucson, AZ 85719
(520) 322-9000

— Additional counsel listed on the inside cover —

BATEMAN & SLADE, INC. BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS

— additional counsel —

DOUGLAS L. GROSE
DOUGLAS L. GROSE, P.A.
2102 W. Cleveland St.
Tampa, FL 33606
(813) 251-3380

JOHN GABROY
GABROY ROLLMAN
AND BOSSÉ, P.C.
3507 N. Campbell Ave.
Suite 111
Tucson, AZ 85719
(520) 320-1300

DALE MCGARVEY
MCGARVEY, HEBERLING,
SULLIVAN & MCGARVEY, P.C.
745 South Main St.
Kalispell, MT 59904-5399
(406) 752-5566

QUESTION PRESENTED

Amicus curiae will address the following question:

> Whether the Utah Supreme Court misapplied deterrence theory in its approach to reviewing the $145 million punitive damage award in this case.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

QUESTION PRESENTED i

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iv

INTEREST OF *AMICUS CURIAE* 1

INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT ... 2

ARGUMENT 4

I. DETERRENCE THEORY PROVIDES USEFUL GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWING PUNITIVE DAMAGE AWARDS 5

A. The Theory of Penalties Provides the Foundation for Deterrence Theory 5

B. The Theory of Penalties Implies that Punitive Damage Awards Should Aim to Make the Injurer Pay the Full Costs of the Harm It Imposes in Some Cases, and in Other Cases the Punitive Damage Award Should Aim to Make the Injurer Disgorge Any Gains It Receives as a Result of Its Harmful Conduct 12

C. In Cases in Which Punitive Damage Awards Should be Designed to Strip the Injurer of Its Gains, the Primary Concern Should be to Avoid Setting an Award that is Less Than the Minimum Necessary to Disgorge Those Gains 18